New Connectivities and Environmental Activism: Examining the Role of Religious Groups with Social Network Analysis on Twitter

Jeremy H. Kidwell

There is something new happening with environmental activism. Whereas environmentalism in the latter half of the twentieth-century was characterised by a variety of fault lines generated by different forms of action whether radical, performative, policy-engaged, habitat-focussed, etc. each orientation drove different agendas such that groups often vied with one another as much as they did with the forces causing ecological devastation. One possible reason for the new turn towards alliances, collaborations, and more dynamic group identities is likely the way that the issue of climate change has captivated the global imagination. The astonishing range and urgency of climate change has drawn activists out from their traditional enclaves and this is shown in a range of new and highly diverse alliances which are emerging, such as "Stop Climate Chaos" in the United Kingdom, or the "Environmental Priorities Coalition" in the USA. In the light of these new forms of connectivity among activist groups, in this study I seek to analyse the digital space occupied by a specific (and often ignored) subset of environmental activists, namely religious groups. Through Social Network Analysis (SNA), I provide an assessment of the twitter traffic and engagement by religious sustainability and environmental groups within the larger constellation of conservation, environmental media, and government sustainability groups on national and international levels. SNA is a particularly well-suited tool for this kind of analysis, as it offers a way to transcend atomistic perspectives and grasp at the new mobilities and connectivities which characterise the work of these groups. As Wasserman and Faust suggest, SNA aims for a "unit of analysis" which is not the individual, "but an entity consisting of a collection of individuals and the linkages among them" {Wasserman 1994@5}. In seeking to better understand the significance and operations of Eco-Congregation Scotland (ECS) in research conducted from 2013-2016, we sought to deploy

SNA towards a range of data and contexts, seeking to understand the environmental networks in which ECS operated and the smaller networks of which ECS was composed.

Before diving into the data and analysis, I would like to preface with some discussion of how environmental groups may be categorised. This will form the basis for some clusters which will help to illuminate some of the analysis which follows. We may begin by dividing environmental groups into two basic categories based on their political disposition. Seen in this way, our first cluster includes those groups which are located within the radical political tradition and which see positive environmental change as requiring a radical transformation or confrontation of the current political structures. Groups working in this mode may often take a confrontational stance, or see themselves as offering a counter-cultural alternative. The most obvious example of this mode of action may be represented by Earth First!, but it also includes groups like Greenpeace, the Greenpeace spin-off Friends of the Earth, or the student group People and Planet. The alternative mode is represented by those groups which seek to work within current political structures, and these groups are often actually quasi-governmental, receiving some or all of their funding from government. Groups which fit this category in Britain include "Keep Britain Tidy" (or the Scottish counterpart "Keep Scotland Beautiful" formerly named ENCAMS), or the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds. This second group is often focussed on good environmental citizenship, and as such prevents a more radical posture which might seek to oppose the structures of civil society which provide the basis for measuring good citizenship. Having laid out these two categories, it is important to note that both have become increasingly unstable over recent decades, with groups such as RSPB widening their focus to include things aside from birds, such as lobbying to change government policy and conversely with groups such as Greenpeace taking on more domestic concerns alongside their traditional focus on dramatic direct action. In both cases, some of the internal membership of these groups has resisted such reorientation, but it has nonetheless become the case that one cannot define an Environmental Non-Governmental Organisation (ENGO) along these lines in a strict sense.

Whether or not they are strictly true, these two categories carry significant aesthetic freight for individuals seeking to participate in environmental action, and this is particularly the case for church groups in Britain seeking to participate in environmental action. In one concrete example of this phenomenon, I had an individual approach me after I had spoken at an event in a church about the research being conducted for this project. The

person waited until everyone in the room had gone and then said to me with a somewhat uneasy expression, "you know, my husband and I are both members of Greenpeace." Their presumption here was that a good church-goer was expected to avoid a radical group like Greenpeace. In my fieldwork, I have found evidence that this phenomena of uneasiness also exists in an inverse way. In one interview with an interfaith environmental group in the USA, a campaigner suggested to me "what we discovered as we became [active] into advocacy, [was that] at first the environmental community was very suspicious of us, very suspicious... and so they thought really that ... we were a trojan horse for creationism and they really didn't know how to deal with us." On both sides, misunderstanding and suspicion have prevented alliances from forming in the past, and yet now we see that these understandings are giving way – even if for strictly pragmatic reasons – to new coalitions which are providing more effective advocacy and organising. Understanding the ways in which religious environmental groups function will benefit from a deeper understanding of these dynamics with other environmental groups, and their place within these networks. It will also be useful to keep this uneasiness in mind when contrasting the levels of connectedness between religious ENGOs and other ENGOs with the levels of connection between religious ENGOs and other parallel religious groups such as denominational leadership and religious media. As I will go on to suggest, there is good reason to suspect that religious ENGOs offer a crucial point of connection to the broader environmental and conservation movement where almost no other forms of connection exist for religious communities to environmental politics.

Analysis 1: Environmentalists on Twitter

From our first data collection pool, we created a social network graph based on twitter participation by religious groups and ENGOs in Britain (both faith-based and secular). For those readers who may not be familiar with SNA jargon, it may be helpful to note that social network analysis consists essentially of individual points (called "nodes" or "vertices") and the visual representation of connections between these points in the form of lines (called "edges"). For our visualisation, nodes were identified using a "snowball" technique, which resulted in a diverse selection of 82 vertices (or nodes). This included the starting point of 10 religious ENGOs (@ecocongregation @ArochaUK @ECenglandwales @JRayl @GreenChristian_ @ARCworld

¹Interview, 25 March 2015.

@ArthurRankCentr @OperationNoah @biggreenjewish @muslimness) and two staff members (@MiriamDobson @gordonhudsonu) as well as a selection of secular ENGOs (such as @rspbscotland @foescot @wwf uk politics), a small selection of twitter-active executives, government conservation groups (such as @naturalengland), development agencies involved in environmental advocacy (such as @oxfamgb), church twitter accounts (@c of e), and several forms of news media including faith/environment sections of mainstream media (@timesfaith @gdnbelief), church-oriented media (@churchtimes), and denominational publications (). The total data set included 17350 edges, and data was obtained and connections calculated using NodeXL software, which took the complete followers / following lists for each node and looked for mentions of these nodes within the most recent 200 tweets for each account. The richness of this dataset can be seen in the inclusion of media, government, secular and religious sources, including some possible sources (especially media) where one might expect to find functioning as a bridge between several sub-groups.

Twitter offers a useful focal point for this kind of analysis because following someone on twitter can often serve more as a symbolic action than a substantive one. It is often the case that active twitter users will have private "lists" which they use as a regular reading list in order to filter out a much larger pool of persons they follow. Consultants on social media engagement will often recommend that whenever someone chooses to "follow" that group on twitter they return the favour by following that person. In this way, following on twitter can serve as a context for offering both reciprocity and recognition. Of course, twitter engagement can be quite uneven, with some groups having begun nearly a decade ago and employing a full-time specialists in social media engagement as a form of outreach and recruiting (at the time of this writing on 28 March 2015 the first node to join twitter among those analysed, @greenpeaceuk, had 121,071 followers and 17,504 tweets whereas @birdlife news, which was roughly in the middle with a start date of July 2009 nonetheless also had 37,388 followers and followed 5819 other twitter users), while for others twitter use is less robust or formally worked-out (@arochauk had only 418 followers and 298 tweets), nonetheless the picture that appears is surprisingly coherent.

Table 1.1 Twitter Activity of Top-10 and Religious ENGO Vertices (See Appendix A for Full Data)

					Joined
					Twit-
					ter
					Date
ID	Vertex Followe	dFollowe	r T weets	Favorit	e¢UTC)
26	oxfamgb8090	198176	24326	797	12-
					Aug-
					08
21	natures_2 422 e	148489	36250	1628	20-
					Jan-
					09
19	greenpeak76010k	121071	17504	669	10-
					Apr-
					07
18	wwf_uk3161	118890	15511	41931	29-
					Jan-
					09
37	defragov 656	76297	10953	129	23-
					Jun-
					09
8	soilassoc 2695 n	70557	19955	4149	6-
					Nov-
					08
58	christian 8450d	70101	17307	187	7-
					Jan-
					09
38	naturale 68 land	68480	8597	134	16-
					Sep-
					09
40	wildlifet 363 ts	55596	9706	5794	16-
					Jul-
					09
59	$c_of_e \ 4378$	47929	8890	249	3-
					Feb-
					09

34 | arcworld | 2649 | 2554 | 1489 | 120 | 17-Feb-09 12 | greenchristian_ | 1204 | 1361 | 4566 | 30 | 17-Feb-12 42 | cofecampaign | 839 | 1325 | 1628

| 11 | 9-Jun-10 31 | operationnoah | 386 | 795 | 908 | 45 | 18-Mar-09 44 | ecocongregation | 190 | 478 | 1543 | 1 | 16-Mar-09 53 | arthurrankcentr | 255 | 426 | 375 | 5 | 2-Mar-10 47 | arochauk | 64 | 418 | 298 | 98 | 24-Sep-13 57 | ecenglandwales | 260 | 295 | 565 | 20 | 24-Apr-13 68 | actscot | 222 | 121 | 95 | 257 | 13-Nov-14 84 | jrayl | 23 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 11-Apr-09

1. Bridges and Outliers

One of the key calculations that is relevant to this analysis is the betweenness centrality. This represents a calculation of the degree to which a specific actor lies on a path between two others, so nodes with a high calculation on this scale represent those which are not just more highly connected, but also act as a bridge between others who are unconnected. Betweenness represents perhaps the most dramatic relief for the religious ENGO in this study. In this analysis, the top three highest between centrality calculations were all religious ENGO's: with @greenchristian_ at 973.237, @operationnoah at 375.604 and @ecocongregation at 250.675. The average Betweenness Centrality was 63.171 and the median Betweenness Centrality was 28.53.

Table 1.2 Top Vertices on Betweenness Centrality Graph Metrics

ID	Vertex (Twitter @Handle)	Betweenness Centrality
12	greenchristian_	973.237
31	operationnoah	375.604
44	ecocongregation	250.675
58	christian_aid	224.759
19	greenpeaceuk	201.979
15	${ m christianaidsco}$	181.776
17	sccscot	161.144
18	wwf_uk	154.77
62	ctbi	145.281
7	${ m peopleandplanet}$	144.455
42	cofecampaign	142.963

53 | arthurrankcentr | 58.347 14 | biggreenjewish | 33.362 34 | arcworld | 32.505 57 | ecenglandwales | 22.307 47 | arochauk | 9.57 60 | muslimness | 0.179 84 | jrayl | 0

Sociologist Mark S. Granovetter highlighted the significance of this kind of networked configuration with his now famous 1973 paper on *The Strength*

of Weak Ties. Granovetter took the common-sense the observation that "our acquaintances (weak ties) are less likely to be socially involved with one another than are our close friends (strong ties)" and noted that though the relationships with these weak ties are less strong and active, this makes them more important than our strong ties in one crucial way. In this way, "the weak tie... becomes not merely a trivial acquaintance tie but rather a crucial bridge between the two densely knit clumps of close friends... these clumps would not, in fact, be connected to one another at all were it not for the existence of weak ties." {Granovetter 1983@201-202}. Granovetter's suggestion fits this context, and applied here it seems fair to suggest that these religious ENGO's play a crucial role in connecting several networks (in this case the religious communities and environmental conservation NGOs) which would likely not be connected at all without this crucial bridge present.

[JK note: I'll add an additional section here running the same analysis again and showing map without any of the 10 ENGO's present to show the contrast]

2. Social Symmetries

A second calculation which is relevant to our inquiry is the degree of symmetry or asymmetry of communication. This relates essentially to reciprocation, and thus those who follow but aren't followed may represent a less overall relevant node within a network.

Analysis 2: Sub-Group Connectivity, ECS Church Websites Analysis 3: Outwards Connections, ECS Application Forms Appendix a: Full Twitter Data

						Joined
						Twit-
						ter
					Time	Date
ID	Vertex Fol	lowedFollowersT	weets Favo	oriteLocationWeb	Zone	(UTC)
26	oxfamgb809	0 198176 24	4326 797	Oxford, http:/	/tIcon/doi	mine Gg TtA
				UK		Aug-
						08

								Joined Twit- ter
ID	Vantara Dallarra	JIC-11	-M4	D:4	I : .	-337-1-	Time	Date
ID	Vertex Followe						Zone	(UTC)
21	natures_2 4212 e	148489	36250	1628	0 ,	http://	t Icontilla	1⊉0 qdZdL
					UK			Jan-
10		191071	17504	cco	TIIZ	1-44 /	/+ /6	09 - 11-00 01 - 1
19	greenpea k7011 k	121071	17504	669	UK	nttp://	t.co/ow	z J M0B8Io1
								Apr- 07
18	wwf_uk3161	118890	15511	41931	Wolsing	chttp:/	/+ Tooy dV/	67 hp 29 4CMZ0
10	ww1uk3101	110090	19911	41931	UK	ζ,πωρ.//	(100)Havi	Jan-
					OIX			09
37	defragov 656	76297	10953	129	UK	http://	t.Icon/illor	02:£07JUQ
٠.	dell'080 (022	.020.	10000	120	011	1100[01//	02207-001	Jun-
								09
8	soilasso 2695 n	70557	19955	4149	The	http://	t Icon/W i	i ® Q6jdfH
					UK	- , ,	,	Nov-
					and			08
					be-			
					yond			
58	christian <u>84</u> 5101	70101	17307	187		http://	t Icon/Non	ns 7 P-E6VE7Y
							Jan-	
								09
38	naturale 6&l and	68480	8597	134		dhttps:/	//Londwa	p6 164 0bqBf
					UK			Sep-
40	11 1116 + 0.01		0700		T.T.	1 /	/. T /TT T	09
40	wildlifet 364 ts	55596	9706	5794	UK,	http://	t Loogidoli	s¥6ŧRLpq
					Isle			Jul-
					of Man			09
					and			
					Alder-			
					ney			
59	c_of_e 4378	47929	8890	249	-	http://	tIcon/HAG	a H wyysR5
50	<u>01</u> 0 10,10	<u>_</u> .	2000	_ +0		P·/ /		Feb-
								09

ter Time Date Zone (UTC) ://tloom/COrRELKhmJ Jul- 09 ://tAcm/spt&RAGHFSSV Dec- 08
://tloop@arH5LKhmJ Jul- 09 ://tloopst5ERGHFSSV Dec- 08
Jul- 09 ://t &m/st&Røl FSSV Dec- 08
09 ://t A:on/sptoEROH FSSV Dec- 08
://t &m/st&R@F SSV Dec- 08
Dec- 08
08
://tlcom/dlownv5Pi3rH7q
Mar-
09
117 1770277
://t Lcon/dkGiN\$ 15g9w8
Feb-
09
://tlcon/dDjfFBLQqDxL
Feb-
11
://tIcon/Work DhZhpxe Feb-
09
://tIcon/ESiM22owqnTS
Mar-
09
://t Loon/85B26 -ECh2a
Jan-
10
://t Edj/OhqgQ -Anstu
Nov-
09

						 ,
						Joined
						Twit-
					_	ter
			_	_		ime Date
ID	Vertex Follower	edFollow	ersweets	Favorit	tesLocationWeb Zo	one (UTC)
49	love_pla2495	15595	5068	969	UK http://tlo	oµ∕dvKQmQzpup
						Jan-
						11
72	eauknew3390	14924	7993	139	London http://t.co	•
						Mar-
						09
3	robintra n 192 0n	14642	13677	27	Totnes, https://t.o	co/IiD J gDMjTL
					De-	May-
					von.	09
					UK	
70	salvationlah414yu	k14402	16614	2562	- ' '	op/Bon1202892SH
					&	Feb-
					Ire-	09
					land	
25	$frack_of 47$	14296	9654	60	$\mathrm{http://t}\mathbf{I}_{\mathbf{G}}$	op/QM42r8uhnRtl
						Jun-
						11
7	peoplean dfilla ne	et12779	16676	1764	Oxford, http://tlo	opt@ZdUSYD&HvqJ
					UK	09
29	cafod 1320	11348	7230	1071	Englandhttp://tlo	qəoXF Ə fxaft 6 Bhr
					&	Dec-
					Wales	08
28	rspbscot land	11058	5286	581	Scotlandttp://tE	di/HbMr@QXX2sVJn
						May-
						11
79	timesfaith0821	10040	1302	0	- ' '	ndstwi Riz biesmnew
					Times,	Aug-
					Lon-	10
					don	
75	gdnbelie $f45$	8845	7838	1	London http://tlo	op/ 21578592 5U47v
						Feb-
						11

ID	Vertex Followe	dFollowe	er T weets	Favorit		Joined Twit- ter Fime Date Zone (UTC)
66	biblesoc 26	8541	3674	61	Englandhttp://tL and Wales	Feb-
65	methodi 6626 dia	8180	7042	164	London,http://t& UK	
20	oxfamsc øtla nd	7675	21897	12419	Scotlanchttp://tI	
48	naturals83¶and	7466	3896	40	in I wild bits of Scot-land	London 31- Aug- 09
30	foescot 1414	6741	10477	376	Edinburght,p://tI	Edi /OyurYdi jvRqM Jul- 09
39	mscinthe 7119	6444	2988	1194	London,http://t.d United King- dom	
52	greeners 256 and	6094	4167	12	Edinburghtp://tk	cd/nlop2:38 8mxm Jul- 09
27	wwf_uk <u>1</u> &Idlitio	c 5 677	7884	31	UK http://tI	cop/domeT&-A4zK Sep- 09
60	muslimn 299 2	5559	8376	21	Englandhttp://tI UK	
45	churchsc 966 and	4559	3425	114	Scotlandhttp://tI	

ID	Vertex Followe	edFollow	er T weets	Favorit	e £ ocatio	onWeb	Time Zone	Joined Twit- ter Date (UTC)
5	ksbscotl ān83	4463	3373	661				 (1921/IF aKg 08
54	ionacom 2 14nity	4446	1321	6	Isle of Iona	http://	∕tÆdj⁄isIbil	Mall.pQbHq Mar- 09
33	britishqu 200 ers	4329	2404	67	Great Britain	- , ,	t Icon (CH	w2Mj15SKp Feb- 10
50	wildabo d&da nt	± 4252	2064	597	Nationa	ahttp://	∕tA con/sAc e	CaptquWVM Jul- 10
16	notarsan d 948	4250	10566	124	UK	http://	t Icon/dbI	X √ OhYdaP; Mar- 10
73	cafodwir£808	3402	3573	126	London	http://	t Icon/Por	nkWGboUbj Mar- 09
9	andy2at &83 s	3177	3795	253	London based. Here and there	http://	/tIcon/ZlXi	aJP0eIlrA Oct- 11
55	fairtrade285iion	2971	1783	470	Glasgov Scot- land	whttp://	tEdjíOR	Feb- 09
64	methrec d&&	2798	1069	5	122 Golden Lane, Lon- don EC1	- , ,	∕tIcon∕iSca	nRIOuVpwdc Aug- 09

ID	Vertex Fo	llowe	d F ollow	er¶weets	Favori	te Ł ocationWeb	Time Zone	Joined Twit- ter Date (UTC)
14	biggreen §9 (vish	2622	2784	11	London,http://	/tIcon/ded	R lb2Q zJpi
						UK		Nov-
							. —	09
56	sciaf 57	1	2608	4922	727	Glasgowhttp://	/tEdi/n0bvij	_
								Jan-
2.4	l ba	40	0554	1.400	100	TTTZ 1 /	/.T / 4=T	10
34	arcworld26	49	2554	1489	120	UK http://	/tlcom/doi	q F 0gucv
								Feb-
81	hantistt 29	a -	2500	2282	19	Didagt http:/	/+ ao / AT	09 120 7 76;;12 7
91	baptistt 32 6	95	2509	2202	19	Didcot http://	/ t.co/ AC	Oct-
								09
33	baptistu 34	angh.	2/82	3401	32		Amster	
,,	Dapus uum	JIISO	2402	0401	32		71115001	Jan-
								09
62	ctbi 128	80	2411	4204	72	http://	/t.Tcon/don	nM7FtLJ4
-					. –	·P·//	7-2	Feb-
								10
10	fossilfreel36	7R	2163	2300	1057	United http://	/t.co/xN	ju l.D aeZ7s
						King-	•	Apr-
						dom		13
51	greener2 g 7	4b r	2087	1727	397	Scotlandittp://	/t.co/6R	1 df2 KPW
								Jan-
								12
67	urcmedi å 10	06	2070	1222	171	United http://	/t.co/nU	4 Q HgGK
						King-		Jan-
						dom		10
11	ssnscotla 76 6	6	1948	1776	152	Stirling, http://	/t .Co.∮aD od	
						Scot-		Jun-
						land		11
32	richard_4dis	x on	1746	7683	7	Edinburgh	Edinbu	_
								Aug-
								11

						Joined Twit- ter
ID	Vertex Followe	dFollowe	er T weets	Favorit		Cime Date Cone (UTC)
4	transitio 645 nis	1733	4567	4	60+ http://tke unis across the UK	ooµgoh5ll7KjyWZ Jan- 10
74	cafodpr ay19	1675	1468	44		oon/dgenBOtwDdy4 Feb- 11
41	publiciss688	1487	4250	43	London http://tk	
12	greenchr i£04 n_	1361	4566	30	UK http://t@	E asailGizhta Zwfm Feb- 12
42	cofecam §31 gn	1325	1628	11	Englandhttp://tla	oop 43X9 UMdv3z Jun- 10
17	sccscot 827	1213	1122	392	Scotlandhttp://tk	
80	secsyno&2	1021	351	0	Scotlandttp://t@	
15	christiar 830 sco	1019	1114	83	Scotlandhttp://tR	
76	cofslifea 67 work	847	1140	14	http://t.c	co/xmZN&1wSsN Jan- 10
13	miriamd 705 on	817	6859	3998	Edinbur gh tp://t&	

								Joined
								Twit-
								ter
							Time	Date
ID	Vertex Followe	dFollow	er T weets	Favorit	e L ocatio	onWeb	Zone	(UTC)
31	operatio 386 ah	795	908	45	UK	http://	t Icoylddd	áylı&CGvP
								Mar-
								09
83	fred_dr 93 4mon	d763	141	0				2-
								Aug-
								11
77	sicscotla 63 5	748	454	257	St	http://	t.co/pk	Ji S4 ⊬7rkm
					An-			Oct-
					drews			13
					Uni-			
					ver-			
					sity_{-}		–	
61	churches@aglanc	1500	7233	2	Englan	dhttp://	t Acon/szttel	rdhahVt9I
								Oct-
								12
44	ecocongrie dation	1478	1543	1	Edinbu	irgintp://	t kê diyin qe	PM edlFI
								Mar-
	.1 OFF	100	075	_	Cı 1	.11. /	/. 0 /01	09
53	arthurra 25 entr	426	375	5		e1 gh ttp://	ticasata	B22coFs2AY
					Park,			Mar-
					War-			10
					wick- shire			
47	arochau l 64	418	298	98	smre	http://	/t.co/7e.	J0 2 4eM9Lu
		110	200	00		1100 P.//	0.00/100	Sep-
								13
57	ecenglan 260 ales	295	565	20		http://	tIcondo	na&Q70PT
	8					117/	, , , , , , ,	Apr-
								13
68	actscot 222	121	95	257	Alloa	http://	t.co/bU	n fB QUjog
						1 //	,	Nov-
								14

ID	Vertex Follow	edFollower	T weets	Favorit	e Ł ocationWeb	Time Zone	Joined Twit- ter Date (UTC)
82	theconv 9 4er	121	140	0	Glasgowhttp://	t E dj/ Jbx (Qgill OdzhqI Oct- 09
78	tsa_scot 201 id	119	337	0	12a http:// Dry- den Road, Loan- head EH20	t Icon/H&A	WWozoxxz Mar- 10
43	ffkirksco %l and	52	22	2	Scotlandhttp://	t Ca\$2bJ k	Olossi Aug- 13
84	jrayl 23	4	0	0	http://	t Reciffyn Time (US & Canada	asSIF76n3 Apr- 09

Appendix B: Full Graph Metrics

				Betweenness Closeness	
	Vertex (Twitter		Out-	Central-	Central-
ID	@Handle)	In-Degree	Degree	ity	ity
3	robintransition	9	5	4.025	0.006
4	transitionunis	12	10	18.353	0.007
5	ksbscotland	13	22	64.384	0.007
6	transitiontowns	19	20	74.179	0.007
7	peopleandplanet	30	12	144.455	0.008
8	soilassociation	23	7	42.843	0.007
9	andy2atkins	21	27	117.878	0.008
10	$fossilfree_uk$	12	15	18.252	0.007

Vertex (Twitter Out- @Handle) Central- lity Central- ity ID @Handle) In-Degree Degree ity ity 11 ssnscotland 13 24 58.311 0.007 12 greenchristian 19 58 973.237 0.01 13 miriamdobson 6 20 50.377 0.007 14 biggreenjewish 5 18 33.362 0.007 15 christianaidsco 19 29 181.776 0.008 16 notarsands 11 11 6.039 0.006 17 sccscot 22 32 161.144 0.008 18 wwf_uk 34 15 154.77 0.008 18 wwf_uk 34 15 154.77 0.008 19 greenpeacuk 33 12 201.979 0.008 20 oxfamscotland 17 10 31.969 0.007 21 <t< th=""><th></th><th></th><th></th><th></th><th colspan="2">Betweenness Closenes</th></t<>					Betweenness Closenes	
ID		Vertex (Twitter		Out-		
12 greenchristian_ 19 58 973.237 0.01 13 miriamdobson 6 20 50.377 0.007 14 biggreenjewish 5 18 33.362 0.007 15 christianaidsco 19 29 181.776 0.008 16 notarsands 11 11 6.039 0.006 17 sccscot 22 32 161.144 0.008 18 wwf_uk 34 15 154.77 0.008 19 greenpeaceuk 33 12 201.979 0.008 20 oxfamscotland 17 10 31.969 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 23<	ID	•	In-Degree	Degree	ity	
13 miriamdobson 6 20 50.377 0.007 14 biggreenjewish 5 18 33.362 0.007 15 christianaidsco 19 29 181.776 0.008 16 notarsands 11 11 6.039 0.006 17 sccscot 22 32 161.144 0.008 18 wwf_uk 34 15 154.77 0.008 18 wwf_uk 34 15 154.77 0.008 19 greenpeaceuk 33 12 201.979 0.008 20 oxfamscotland 17 10 31.969 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 24	11	ssnscotland	13	24	58.311	0.007
14 biggreenjewish 5 18 33.362 0.007 15 christianaidsco 19 29 181.776 0.008 16 notarsands 11 11 6.039 0.006 17 sccscot 22 32 161.144 0.008 18 wwf_uk 34 15 154.77 0.008 19 greenpeaceuk 33 12 201.979 0.008 20 oxfamscotland 17 10 31.969 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 23 buzz_dont_tweet 18 21 24.035 0.007 24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25	12	$greenchristian_$	19	58	973.237	0.01
15 christianaidsco 19 29 181.776 0.008 16 notarsands 11 11 6.039 0.006 17 sccscot 22 32 161.144 0.008 18 wwf_uk 34 15 154.77 0.008 19 greenpeaceuk 33 12 201.979 0.008 20 oxfamscotland 17 10 31.969 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 23 buzz_dont_tweet 18 21 24.035 0.007 24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28	13	miriamdobson	6	20	50.377	0.007
16 notarsands 11 11 6.039 0.006 17 sccscot 22 32 161.144 0.008 18 wwf_uk 34 15 154.77 0.008 19 greenpeaceuk 33 12 201.979 0.008 20 oxfamscotland 17 10 31.969 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 23 buzz_dont_tweet 18 21 24.035 0.007 24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 28	14	biggreenjewish	5	18	33.362	0.007
17 sccscot 22 32 161.144 0.008 18 wwf_uk 34 15 154.77 0.008 19 greenpeaceuk 33 12 201.979 0.008 20 oxfamscotland 17 10 31.969 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 23 buzz_dont_tweet 18 21 24.035 0.007 24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foes	15	christianaidsco	19	29	181.776	0.008
18 wwf_uk 34 15 154.77 0.008 19 greenpeaceuk 33 12 201.979 0.008 20 oxfamscotland 17 10 31.969 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 23 buzz_dont_tweet 18 21 24.035 0.007 24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.008 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30	16	notarsands	11	11	6.039	0.006
19 greenpeaceuk 33 12 201.979 0.008 20 oxfamscotland 17 10 31.969 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 23 buzz_dont_tweet 18 21 24.035 0.007 24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 <	17	sccscot	22	32	161.144	0.008
20 oxfamscotland 17 10 31.969 0.007 21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 23 buzz_dont_tweet 18 21 24.035 0.007 24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 <t< td=""><td>18</td><td>wwf_uk</td><td>34</td><td>15</td><td>154.77</td><td>0.008</td></t<>	18	wwf_uk	34	15	154.77	0.008
21 natures_voice 27 15 69.186 0.008 22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 23 buzz_dont_tweet 18 21 24.035 0.007 24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdli	19	greenpeaceuk	33	12	201.979	0.008
22 38_degrees 12 6 12.897 0.007 23 buzz_dont_tweet 18 21 24.035 0.007 24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 b	20	oxfamscotland	17	10	31.969	0.007
23 buzz_dont_tweet 18 21 24.035 0.007 24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 <td< td=""><td>21</td><td>natures_voice</td><td>27</td><td>15</td><td>69.186</td><td>0.008</td></td<>	21	natures_voice	27	15	69.186	0.008
24 mcsuk 17 21 26.22 0.007 25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 de	22	38_degrees	12	6	12.897	0.007
25 frack_off 14 4 9.157 0.007 26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 38 <t< td=""><td>23</td><td>buzz_dont_tweet</td><td>18</td><td>21</td><td>24.035</td><td>0.007</td></t<>	23	buzz_dont_tweet	18	21	24.035	0.007
26 oxfamgb 26 5 126.571 0.008 27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38	24	mcsuk	17	21	26.22	0.007
27 wwf_uk_politics 15 15 48.283 0.007 28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 </td <td>25</td> <td>$frack_off$</td> <td>14</td> <td>4</td> <td>9.157</td> <td>0.007</td>	25	$frack_off$	14	4	9.157	0.007
28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41	26	oxfamgb	26	5	126.571	0.008
28 rspbscotland 19 26 56.571 0.007 29 cafod 16 15 41.483 0.007 30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 <	27	wwf_uk_politics	15	15	48.283	0.007
30 foescot 22 28 99.544 0.008 31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44	28	rspbscotland	19	26	56.571	0.007
31 operationnoah 23 34 375.604 0.008 32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 4	29	cafod	16	15	41.483	0.007
32 richard_dixon 16 11 16.602 0.006 33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	30	foescot	22	28	99.544	0.008
33 britishquakers 13 13 29.595 0.007 34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	31	operationnoah	23	34	375.604	0.008
34 arcworld 11 17 32.505 0.007 35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	32	richard_dixon	16	11	16.602	0.006
35 birdlife_news 12 7 7.401 0.007 36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	33	britishquakers	13	13	29.595	0.007
36 scotwildlife 17 16 16.908 0.007 37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	34	arcworld	11	17	32.505	0.007
37 defragovuk 24 9 29.309 0.007 38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	35	birdlife_news	12	7	7.401	0.007
38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	36	scotwildlife	17	16	16.908	0.007
38 naturalengland 21 14 28.602 0.007 39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	37	defragovuk	24	9	29.309	0.007
39 mscintheuk 12 9 5.801 0.007 40 wildlifetrusts 21 8 22.625 0.007 41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	38	_	21	14	28.602	0.007
41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	39	mscintheuk	12	9	5.801	0.007
41 publicissues 13 18 24.635 0.007 42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	40	wildlifetrusts	21	8	22.625	0.007
42 cofecampaign 16 33 142.963 0.008 43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007	41	publicissues	13	18		0.007
43 ffkirkscotland 4 6 1.7 0.006 44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007		*			142.963	
44 ecocongregation 24 32 250.675 0.008 45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007		1 0				
45 churchscotland 22 21 115.148 0.007						
		bct				

				Betweenness Closeness	
	Vertex (Twitter		Out-	Central-	Central-
ID	@Handle)	In-Degree	Degree	ity	ity
47	arochauk	7	12	9.57	0.007
48	naturalscotland	11	14	7.88	0.007
49	$love_plants$	18	14	28.457	0.007
50	wildaboutplants	10	22	17.465	0.007
51	${\it greener2gethr}$	11	15	9.091	0.007
52	greenerscotland	17	14	37.626	0.007
53	arthurrank centr	7	15	58.347	0.007
54	ionacommunity	15	10	41.144	0.007
55	fairtradenation	8	7	2.356	0.006
56	sciaf	15	15	52.83	0.007
57	ecenglandwales	7	17	22.307	0.007
58	christian_aid	37	15	224.759	0.008
59	c_of_e	30	10	84.382	0.008
60	muslimness	3	4	0.179	0.006
61	churchesengland	11	15	7.862	0.006
62	ctbi	26	36	145.281	0.008
63	baptistuniongb	14	14	11.615	0.007
64	methrecorder	9	15	11.623	0.007
65	methodistmedia	24	15	32.847	0.007
66	biblesociety	14	7	13.078	0.006
67	urcmedia	18	20	33.035	0.007
68	actscot	9	21	48.395	0.007
69	churchtimes	21	22	99.503	0.008
70	salvationarmyuk	14	14	36.584	0.007
71	catholicherald	14	3	12.752	0.007
72	eauknews	18	16	55.214	0.007
73	cafodwire	11	14	16.886	0.007
74	cafodprayer	6	10	3.781	0.006
75	gdnbelief	16	3	16.388	0.007
76	cofslifeandwork	13	13	17.08	0.006
77	sicscotland	7	11	9.557	0.006
78	$tsa_scotland$	7	18	19.974	0.006
79	timesfaith	8	2	1.919	0.006
80	secsynod	10	10	8.046	0.007
81	baptisttimes	11	9	2.686	0.006
82	theconvener	4	5	0.537	0.006

				Betweenness Closeness	
	Vertex (Twitter		Out-	Central-	Central-
ID	@Handle)	In-Degree	Degree	ity	ity
83	$fred_drummond$	9	8	5.329	0.006
84	jrayl	0	0	0	0